THE BRUEG(H)EL PHENOMENON
Paintings by Pieter Bruegel the Elder and Pieter Brueghel the Younger
With a Special Focus on Technique and Copying Practice

Christina CURRIE and Dominique ALLART

Contents
Preface
Acknowledgements
Note to the Reader

INTRODUCTION

A GREAT PAINTER OF THE RENAISSANCE, HIS HEIR AND COPYIST AND THE ANTWERP ART MARKET
- A Brilliant Dynasty of Painters
- Pieter Bruegel the Elder: His Life and Work
- Pieter Bruegel the Elder’s Posthumous Fame
- Proliferation of Copies After Pieter Bruegel the Elder at the End of the Sixteenth Century
- Pieter Brueghel the Younger: His Life and Work
- Inique facis nisi Patrem in Filio nosci: Pieter Brueghel the Younger as Continuator of His Father
- The Art Market in Antwerp at the Time of Pieter Brueghel the Younger
- Reconstructing Antwerp Workshops’ Organisational Practices
- Rechte princepalen! The Rise of Connoisseurship
- The Works of Pieter Brueghel the Younger in Seventeenth Century Antwerp Inventories
- Signatures and Dates in Bruegel the Elder’s and Brueghel the Younger’s Works

THE PAINTING TECHNIQUE OF PIETER BRUEGEL THE ELDER: CASE STUDIES
- Status Quaestionis
  - Preliminary Note Regarding the Paintings Examined
  - The Census at Bethlehem (Brussels, Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique - Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België)
    - Provenance
    - Inscriptions
    - Painting Support
      - Format and Construction - Barbes and Unprepared Lateral Edges - Condition
    - Preparatory Layers
    - Underdrawing
      - Form and Function - Drawing Medium - Position of Underdrawing in the Layer Structure - The Role of the Underdrawing in the Creative Process
    - Paint Layer
      - Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Modifications During Painting
    - Conclusion
- The Sermon of St John the Baptist (Budapest, Szépmüvészeti Múzeum)
  - Provenance
  - Inscriptions
• Painting Support
  o Format and Construction - *Barbes* and Unprepared Edges - Condition
• Preparatory Layers
• Underdrawing
  o Form and Function - The Role of the Underdrawing in the Creative Process
• Paint Layer
  o Condition - Palette - Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Gesture and Expression - Modifications During Painting
• Conclusion

- *The Winter Landscape with Bird Trap* (Brussels, Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique - Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België)
  • Provenance, Rediscovery and Early Controversy
  • Inscriptions
  • Fingerprint
  • Painting Support
    o Format and Construction - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Condition
  • Preparatory Layers
  • Underdrawing
    o Form and Function - The Place of the Underdrawing in the Evolution of the Composition - An Early Drawing of the Composition
  • Paint Layer
    o Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
  • Conclusion

- *The Adoration of the Magi* (Winterthur, Dr Oskar Reinhart Collection ‘Am Römerholz’)
  • Provenance
  • Inscriptions
  • Painting Support
    o Format and Construction - Condition
  • Preparatory Layers
  • Underdrawing
  • Paint Layer
    o Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
  • Conclusion

**PIETER BRUEGEL THE ELDER’S PANEL PAINTING TECHNIQUE: A REASSESSMENT**

- **Painting Supports**
  • Format and Construction
  • *Barbes* and Unprepared Edges

- Preparatory Layers
  • Ground
  • *Imprimatura*

- Underdrawing
  • Drawing Materials
  • Position of Underdrawing in the Layer Structure
  • Underdrawing Styles and Modifications During Drawing and Painting

- Painting Techniques
  • Pigment Analysis and Layer Structure
  • Sequence of Painting
  • Brushwork and Handling

**THE PAINTING TECHNIQUE OF PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER AND HIS STUDIO: CASE STUDIES**

- *Status Quaestionis*

- Preliminary Note Regarding the Paintings Examined

- Copies of the *Battle between Carnival and Lent* After Pieter Bruegel the Elder
  • Inscriptions
- Copies of the "Census at Bethlehem" After Pieter Bruegel the Elder
  - Inscriptions
  - Painting Supports
    - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding - Barbes and Unprepared Lateral Edges
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing
    - Form and Function - Style and Attribution
  - Paint Layer
    - Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
  - The Model for the Copies
    - Comparison of the Sons’ Copies With Bruegel the Elder’s Budapest Version - Jan Brueghel and Pieter the Younger’s Possible Working Relationship - Two Variants
  - Copying Process
    - Use of Cartoons and Transfer Process - Partial Correlation with Bruegel the Elder’s Budapest Version
  - Conclusion
- Copies of the "Winter Landscape with Bird Trap" After Pieter Bruegel the Elder
  - Inscriptions
  - Painting Supports
    - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing
    - Form and Function - Attribution
  - Paint Layer
The Model for the Copies
- Bruegel the Elder’s Version in the Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts - Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België - The Case of the Painting in the Former M. A. Hassid Collection

Copying Process
- Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Two Additional Motifs in the Antwerp and Coppée-le Hodey Versions
- Bruegel’s Competition: Contemporary Copies and Variants Produced by Other Workshops

Excursus: A Late Nineteenth or Early Twentieth Century Copy

Conclusion

Copies of the Adoration of the Magi After Pieter Bruegel the Elder

Inscriptions

Painting Supports
- Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding

Preparatory Layers

Underdrawing
- Form and Function - Attribution

Paint Layer
- Condition - Palette, Paint Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution

The Model for the Copies
- Differences Between Bruegel the Elder’s Original Version and the Copies - The Existence of Two Faithful Copies

Copying Process
- Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Differences Amongst the Copies - A Copy from Outside Brueghel the Younger’s Studio

Conclusion

The Magpie On the Gallows: A Unique Copy After Pieter Bruegel the Elder

Inscriptions

Painting Support
- Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks

Preparatory Layers

Underdrawing

Paint Layer
- Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling

The Model for the Copy
- Bruegel the Elder’s Original Version - A Version in the Former Bruno Donath Collection

Copying Process

Original Version and the Copy: A Comparison

Conclusion

Copies of the Wedding Dance in the Open Air Probably After a Lost Painting by Pieter Bruegel the Elder

Inscriptions

Painting Supports
- Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding

Copy Process

Preparatory Layers

Underdrawing
- Form and Function - Adjustments in Design During Drawing and Painting - Drawing Notations - Attribution

Paint Layer
- Condition - Palette - Pigment Analysis and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution

Copying Process and Reflections on the Model
- Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Motifs Not Present on the Cartoon - Colour - Searching For the Original Model - Evidence for a Lost Painting by Bruegel the Elder: Versions by Jan Brueghel and a Variant by Martin van Cleve

Conclusion

Copies of the Crucifixion Probably After a Lost Painting by Pieter Bruegel the Elder

Inscriptions

Creation of a Compositional Variant and Collaboration with Joos de Momper the Younger
• Painting Supports
  o Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding - Barbes and Unprepared Lateral Edges
• Preparatory Layers
• Underdrawing
  o Form and Function - Attribution
• Paint Layer
  o Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Brushwork, Handling and Attribution - Sequence of Painting
• Copying Process and Reflections on the Model
  o Common Cartoons for the Figures - Townscape and Landscape Backgrounds: No Evidence for a Common Cartoon - Colour Correspondence in the Figures - Original Model - Hypothesis of a Lost Crucifixion by Bruegel the Elder: Source Documents - The Vienna Version of the Crucifixion by Jan Brueghel I - Searching For the Appearance of a Lost Original by Bruegel the Elder
• Conclusion

- Copies of the Massacre of the Innocents Probably After a Lost Painting by Martin Van Cleve
  • Inscriptions
  • Painting Supports
  o Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating
  • Preparatory Layers
  • Underdrawing
  o Form and Function - Attribution
  • Paint Layer
  o Condition - Palette - Pigment Analysis and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
  • Copying Process and Reflections on the Model
  o Original Model - Transfer Process
  • The Brussels Version: Evidence of a Cover-up
  o The First Painting - Re-use of Panels in the Sixteenth Century - Why This Re-use In Brueghel’s Workshop?
  • Conclusion

- Copies of the Peasant Lawyer After an Anonymous Model
  • Inscriptions
  • Painting Supports
  o Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
  • Preparatory Layers
  • Underdrawing
  o Form and Function - Attribution
  • Paint Layer
  o Condition - Palette and Pigments - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
  • Copying Process and Reflections on the Model
  o Hypotheses as to Original Model - Two Variants - Use of Cartoons and Transfer Process
  • Copies by Brueghel the Younger’s Contemporaries and Later Imitators
  • Conclusion

DEMYSTIFYING THE PROCESS: PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER’S STUDIO PRACTICE

- Painting Supports
  • Format and Provenance of the Wood
  • Barbes and Unpainted Lateral Edges, with Corresponding Rebates on the Reverse
  • The Antwerp Brand and Panel-makers’ Marks
  • Quality

- Preparatory Layers
  • Ground
  • Imprimatura

- The Role of Cartoons
  • The Transfer Process
  • Single or Partial Pricked Cartoons
  • The Nature of the Cartoons: The Notion of an Original Master Cartoon and Working ‘Substitute Cartoons’

- Underdrawing
  • Graphite as Underdrawing Medium
• The Position of the Underdrawing in the Layer Structure
• The Extent and Character of the Underdrawing
• Cartoon Transfer and Underdrawing Step-by-Step

- **Painting Techniques**
  • Palette
  • Pigment Analysis and Layer Structure
  • Sequence of Painting
  • Brushwork and Handling
  • Late Additions

**SEARCHING FOR THE HAND OF PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER**

- The Underdrawings
  • A Core Group of Underdrawings by the Master
  • Underdrawings Outside the Core Group
  • Drawings in the Manner of Bruegel the Elder: The Question of Attribution

- The Painting Stage
  • A Core Group of Paintings by the Master
  • Paintings Outside the Core Group
  • Significance of a Signature

**PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER’S MODELS AND THE ISSUE OF VARIANTS**

- Bruegel the Younger’s Models
  • Paintings for which Bruegel the Elder’s Original Versions Still Survive
  • Paintings Presumed to be After Lost Works by Bruegel the Elder
  • Paintings After Missing Works by Other Artists

- Variants and Variation in Brueghel the Younger’s Production
  • Compositional Variants
  • Variation in the Later Years
  • Organisation Practice Under Brueghel the Younger’s Aegis

**AROUND PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER: COPIES BY OTHER ARTISTS**

- Brueghelian Compositions Produced by Contemporary or Later Followers
- Observations on Two of Jan Brueghel the Elder’s Copies
- Solving a Famous Controversy: The Fall of Icarus, Two Anonymous Copies
  • History of the Controversy
  • The Version in the Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique – Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België in Brussels
    o Provenance - Support - Radiocarbon Dating - Underdrawing - Paint layer - Conclusion
  • The Version in the Van Buuren Museum in Brussels
    o Provenance - Support - Underdrawing - Paint layer - Conclusion
  • Conclusion

**UNDERSTANDING THE FATHER THROUGH THE SON: LOST SECRETS OF PIETER BRUEGEL THE ELDER’S WORKING PRACTICE**

- Evidence from the Copies: Bruegel’s Lost Compositional Drawings
- Evidence from the Copies: Bruegel’s Lost Cartoons
- Evidence from the Originals: The Nature of the Lost Cartoons
- Other Preparatory Material Employed by Bruegel
- Record Copies?
- Model Drawings and Preparatory Cartoons in the Southern Netherlands
- From Drawing to Painting: Bruegel’s Creative Process Reconstructed

**CONCLUSIONS**
APPENDICES

1. Historical Copying Techniques
   - A Note on Cartoons - Squaring - Pouncing - Tracing - The Counterproof Method - Proportional Compasses - Pantograph - Mixed Methods of Transfer

2. Practical Reconstructions (Christina Currie, with the Collaboration of Bob Ghys)
   - Preparation of Test Panels and Drawing Materials - Squaring - Tracing - Pouncing - Pantograph - Alternative Methods - Discussion

3. Paintings Studied from the Workshop of Pieter Brueghel the Younger: Dates, Signatures, Key Technical Features

4. Identifying Pieter Brueghel the Younger’s Underdrawing Medium (Christina Currie and Steven Saverwys)
   - Historical Context
     - Black Chalk - Graphite - Metalpoint
   - Identification of Underdrawing in Paint Samples
   - Analysis of Underdrawing in Brueghel the Younger’s Paintings
     - Experimental Conditions - Crucifixion - Massacre of the Innocents - Wedding Dance in the Open Air - X-ray Fluorescence Analysis of Two Small Format Paintings by Brueghel the Younger - Experimental Conditions - Results
   - Conclusion

5. Dendro-archaeological Examination of Paintings by Pieter Brueghel the Younger (Pascale Fraiture)
   - Provenance of the Wood, Mechanical and Technical Characteristics - Planks from the Same Tree in Different Paintings - Dating - Conclusion

6. Attribution in Pieter Brueghel the Younger’s Production in the Works Studied
   - Core Group of Underdrawings by the Master
   - Core Group of Paintings by the Master

7. Charts of Variants
   - Variable Motifs and Colours in the Census at Bethlehem Series
   - Variable Motifs and Colours in the Sermon of St John the Baptist Series
   - Variable Motifs and Colours in the Peasant Lawyer Series

This volume will be published in the IRPA/KIK Scientia Artis series in 2011.