



## THE BRUEG(H)EL PHENOMENON

### Paintings by Pieter Bruegel the Elder and Pieter Brueghel the Younger With a Special Focus on Technique and Copying Practice

Christina CURRIE and Dominique ALLART

#### Contents

#### Preface

#### Acknowledgements

#### Note to the Reader

#### INTRODUCTION

#### A GREAT PAINTER OF THE RENAISSANCE, HIS HEIR AND COPYIST AND THE ANTWERP ART MARKET

- A Brilliant Dynasty of Painters
- Pieter Bruegel the Elder: His Life and Work
- Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Posthumous Fame
- Proliferation of Copies After Pieter Bruegel the Elder at the End of the Sixteenth Century
- Pieter Brueghel the Younger: His Life and Work
- *Inique facis nisi Patrem in Filio nosci*: Pieter Brueghel the Younger as Continuator of His Father
- The Art Market in Antwerp at the Time of Pieter Brueghel the Younger
- Reconstructing Antwerp Workshops' Organisational Practices
- *Rechte princepalen!* The Rise of Connoisseurship
- The Works of Pieter Brueghel the Younger in Seventeenth Century Antwerp Inventories
- Signatures and Dates in Bruegel the Elder's and Brueghel the Younger's Works

#### THE PAINTING TECHNIQUE OF PIETER BRUEGEL THE ELDER: CASE STUDIES

- *Status Quaestionis*
- Preliminary Note Regarding the Paintings Examined
- ***The Census at Bethlehem* (Brussels, Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique - Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België)**
  - Provenance
  - Inscriptions
  - Painting Support
    - Format and Construction - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Edges - Condition
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing
    - Form and Function - Drawing Medium - Position of Underdrawing in the Layer Structure - The Role of the Underdrawing in the Creative Process
  - Paint Layer
    - Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Modifications During Painting
  - Conclusion
- ***The Sermon of St John the Baptist* (Budapest, Szépművészeti Múzeum)**
  - Provenance
  - Inscriptions

- Painting Support
  - Format and Construction - *Barbes* and Unprepared Edges - Condition
- Preparatory Layers
- Underdrawing
  - Form and Function - The Role of the Underdrawing in the Creative Process
- Paint Layer
  - Condition - Palette - Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting – Brushwork and Handling - Gesture and Expression - Modifications During Painting
- Conclusion
- ***The Winter Landscape with Bird Trap* (Brussels, Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique - Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België)**
  - Provenance, Rediscovery and Early Controversy
  - Inscriptions
  - Fingerprint
  - Painting Support
    - Format and Construction - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Condition
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing
    - Form and Function - The Place of the Underdrawing in the Evolution of the Composition - An Early Drawing of the Composition
  - Paint Layer
    - Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
  - Conclusion
- ***The Adoration of the Magi* (Winterthur, Dr Oskar Reinhart Collection ‘Am Römerholz’)**
  - Provenance
  - Inscriptions
  - Painting Support
    - Format and Construction - Condition
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing
  - Paint Layer
    - Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
  - Conclusion

## **PIETER BRUEGEL THE ELDER’S PANEL PAINTING TECHNIQUE: A REASSESSMENT**

- **Painting Supports**
  - Format and Construction
  - *Barbes* and Unprepared Edges
- **Preparatory Layers**
  - Ground
  - *Imprimatura*
- **Underdrawing**
  - Drawing Materials
  - Position of Underdrawing in the Layer Structure
  - Underdrawing Styles and Modifications During Drawing and Painting
- **Painting Techniques**
  - Pigment Analysis and Layer Structure
  - Sequence of Painting
  - Brushwork and Handling

## **THE PAINTING TECHNIQUE OF PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER AND HIS STUDIO: CASE STUDIES**

- *Status Quaestionis*
- Preliminary Note Regarding the Paintings Examined
- **Copies of the *Battle between Carnival and Lent* After Pieter Bruegel the Elder**
  - Inscriptions

- Painting Supports
    - Format and Panel Construction - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Edges
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Transfer of the Design to the Prepared Panel Surface: Evidence for the Use of Pricked Cartoons
    - A Series of Smaller Cartoons rather than a Whole Sheet
  - Underdrawing
    - Form and Function - Modifications in Relation to the Pounced Design - Style
  - Paint Layer
    - Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
  - The Original Model and the Cartoon
    - The Possible Whereabouts of the Original Version at the Time of Brueghel the Younger - The Original Version and the Five Copies: A Comparison - The Christie's New York Version - The Portland Version - A Hierarchy of Copies - The Source of the Cartoon
  - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Census at Bethlehem After Pieter Bruegel the Elder***
- Inscriptions
  - Painting Supports
    - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - The Panel Maker and Branding - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Edges
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing
    - Form and Function - Modifications During Underdrawing and Painting - Stylistic Variation and the Question of Attribution
  - Paint Layer
    - Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Reflections on Attribution - Style and Brushwork in Comparison to Bruegel the Elder's Original Version
  - The Model for the Copies
    - Key Elements Missing in the Copies Versus Bruegel the Elder's Original Painting - Key Elements Transformed in the Copies - Misinterpretation of Original Motifs - Elements in Underdrawing of Original, Dropped During Painting but Repeated in the Copies - Colours - Placement of Signature - Pre-conclusion
  - Variants Amongst the Copies
    - Five Variants and a Sub-variant - Motifs Varying According to Group - Dating - Secondary Models: Drawings, Underdrawings or Finished Paintings? - Four Groups - Pre-conclusion
  - Copying Process
    - Use of Cartoons - Transfer Process - The Source of the Cartoons
  - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Sermon of St John the Baptist After Pieter Bruegel the Elder***
- Inscriptions
  - Painting Supports
    - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Edges
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing:
    - Form and Function - Style and Attribution
  - Paint Layer
    - Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
  - The Model for the Copies
    - Comparison of the Sons' Copies With Bruegel the Elder's Budapest Version - Jan Brueghel and Pieter the Younger's Possible Working Relationship - Two Variants
  - Copying Process
    - Use of Cartoons and Transfer Process - Partial Correlation with Bruegel the Elder's Budapest Version
  - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Winter Landscape with Bird Trap After Pieter Bruegel the Elder***
- Inscriptions
  - Painting Supports
    - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing
    - Form and Function - Attribution
  - Paint Layer

- Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
  - The Model for the Copies
    - Bruegel the Elder's Version in the Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts - Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België - The Case of the Painting in the Former M. A. Hassid Collection
  - Copying Process
    - Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Two Additional Motifs in the Antwerp and Coppée-le Hodey Versions
  - Brueghel's Competition: Contemporary Copies and Variants Produced by Other Workshops
  - *Excursus* : A Late Nineteenth or Early Twentieth Century Copy
  - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Adoration of the Magi* After Pieter Bruegel the Elder**
  - Inscriptions
  - Painting Supports
    - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing
    - Form and Function - Attribution
  - Paint Layer
    - Condition - Palette, Paint Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
  - The Model for the Copies
    - Differences Between Bruegel the Elder's Original Version and the Copies - The Existence of Two Faithful Copies
  - Copying Process
    - Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Differences Amongst the Copies - A Copy from Outside Brueghel the Younger's Studio
  - Conclusion
- ***The Magpie On the Gallows: A Unique Copy* After Pieter Bruegel the Elder**
  - Inscriptions
  - Painting Support
    - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing
  - Paint Layer
    - Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
  - The Model for the Copy
    - Bruegel the Elder's Original Version - A Version in the Former Bruno Donath Collection
  - Copying Process
  - Original Version and the Copy: A Comparison
  - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Wedding Dance in the Open Air* Probably After a Lost Painting by Pieter Bruegel the Elder**
  - Inscriptions
  - Painting Supports
    - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
  - Copy Process
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing
    - Form and Function - Adjustments in Design During Drawing and Painting - Drawing Notations - Attribution
  - Paint Layer
    - Condition - Palette - Pigment Analysis and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
  - Copying Process and Reflections on the Model
    - Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Motifs Not Present on the Cartoon - Colour - Searching For the Original Model - Evidence for a Lost Painting by Bruegel the Elder: Versions by Jan Brueghel and a Variant by Martin van Cleve
  - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Crucifixion* Probably After a Lost Painting by Pieter Bruegel the Elder**
  - Inscriptions
  - Creation of a Compositional Variant and Collaboration with Joos de Momper the Younger

- Painting Supports
  - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Edges
- Preparatory Layers
- Underdrawing
  - Form and Function - Attribution
- Paint Layer
  - Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Brushwork, Handling and Attribution - Sequence of Painting
- Copying Process and Reflections on the Model
  - Common Cartoons for the Figures - Townscape and Landscape Backgrounds: No Evidence for a Common Cartoon - Colour Correspondence in the Figures - Original Model - Hypothesis of a Lost *Crucifixion* by Bruegel the Elder: Source Documents - The Vienna Version of the *Crucifixion* by Jan Bruegel I - Searching For the Appearance of a Lost Original by Bruegel the Elder
- Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Massacre of the Innocents* Probably After a Lost Painting by Martin Van Cleve**
  - Inscriptions
  - Painting Supports
    - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing
    - Form and Function - Attribution
  - Paint Layer
    - Condition - Palette - Pigment Analysis and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
  - Copying Process and Reflections on the Model
    - Original Model - Transfer Process
  - The Brussels Version: Evidence of a Cover-up
    - The First Painting - Re-use of Panels in the Sixteenth Century - Why This Re-use In Bruegel's Workshop?
  - Conclusion
- **Copies of the *Peasant Lawyer* After an Anonymous Model**
  - Inscriptions
  - Painting Supports
    - Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
  - Preparatory Layers
  - Underdrawing
    - Form and Function - Attribution
  - Paint Layer
    - Condition - Palette and Pigments - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
  - Copying Process and Reflections on the Model
    - Hypotheses as to Original Model - Two Variants - Use of Cartoons and Transfer Process
  - Copies by Bruegel the Younger's Contemporaries and Later Imitators
  - Conclusion

## DEMYSTIFYING THE PROCESS: PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER'S STUDIO PRACTICE

- **Painting Supports**
  - Format and Provenance of the Wood
  - *Barbes* and Unpainted Lateral Edges, with Corresponding Rebates on the Reverse
  - The Antwerp Brand and Panel-makers' Marks
  - Quality
- **Preparatory Layers**
  - Ground
  - *Imprimatura*
- **The Role of Cartoons**
  - The Transfer Process
  - Single or Partial Pricked Cartoons
  - The Nature of the Cartoons: The Notion of an Original Master Cartoon and Working 'Substitute Cartoons'
- **Underdrawing**
  - Graphite as Underdrawing Medium

- The Position of the Underdrawing in the Layer Structure
- The Extent and Character of the Underdrawing
- Cartoon Transfer and Underdrawing Step-by-Step
- **Painting Techniques**
  - Palette
  - Pigment Analysis and Layer Structure
  - Sequence of Painting
  - Brushwork and Handling
  - Late Additions

## **SEARCHING FOR THE HAND OF PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER**

- **The Underdrawings**
  - A Core Group of Underdrawings by the Master
  - Underdrawings Outside the Core Group
  - Drawings in the Manner of Bruegel the Elder: The Question of Attribution
- **The Painting Stage**
  - A Core Group of Paintings by the Master
  - Paintings Outside the Core Group
  - Significance of a Signature

## **PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER'S MODELS AND THE ISSUE OF VARIANTS**

- **Brueghel the Younger's Models**
  - Paintings for which Bruegel the Elder's Original Versions Still Survive
  - Paintings Presumed to be After Lost Works by Bruegel the Elder
  - Paintings After Missing Works by Other Artists
- **Variants and Variation in Brueghel the Younger's Production**
  - Compositional Variants
  - Variation in the Later Years
  - Organisation Practice Under Brueghel the Younger's Aegis

## **AROUND PIETER BRUEGHEL THE YOUNGER: COPIES BY OTHER ARTISTS**

- **Brueghelian Compositions Produced by Contemporary or Later Followers**
- **Observations on Two of Jan Brueghel the Elder's Copies**
- **Solving a Famous Controversy: The Fall of Icarus, Two Anonymous Copies**
  - History of the Controversy
  - The Version in the Musées Royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique – Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België in Brussels
    - Provenance - Support - Radiocarbon Dating - Underdrawing - Paint layer - Conclusion
  - The Version in the Van Buuren Museum in Brussels
    - Provenance - Support - Underdrawing - Paint layer - Conclusion
  - Conclusion

## **UNDERSTANDING THE FATHER THROUGH THE SON: LOST SECRETS OF PIETER BRUEGEL THE ELDER'S WORKING PRACTICE**

- Evidence from the Copies: Bruegel's Lost Compositional Drawings
- Evidence from the Copies: Bruegel's Lost Cartoons
- Evidence from the Originals: The Nature of the Lost Cartoons
- Other Preparatory Material Employed by Bruegel
- Record Copies?
- Model Drawings and Preparatory Cartoons in the Southern Netherlands
- From Drawing to Painting: Bruegel's Creative Process Reconstructed

## **CONCLUSIONS**

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

## LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

## PHOTOGRAPHIC CREDITS

## APPENDICES

- **1. Historical Copying Techniques**
  - A Note on Cartoons - Squaring - Pouncing - Tracing - The Counterproof Method - Proportional Compasses - Pantograph - Mixed Methods of Transfer
- **2. Practical Reconstructions (Christina Currie, with the Collaboration of Bob Ghys)**
  - Preparation of Test Panels and Drawing Materials - Squaring - Tracing - Pouncing - Pantograph - Alternative Methods - Discussion
- **3. Paintings Studied from the Workshop of Pieter Brueghel the Younger: Dates, Signatures, Key Technical Features**
- **4. Identifying Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Underdrawing Medium (Christina Currie and Steven Saverwyns)**
  - Historical Context
    - Black Chalk - Graphite - Metalpoint
  - Identification of Underdrawing in Paint Samples
  - Analysis of Underdrawing in Brueghel the Younger's Paintings
    - Experimental Conditions - *Crucifixion* - *Massacre of the Innocents* - *Wedding Dance in the Open Air* - X-ray Fluorescence Analysis of Two Small Format Paintings by Brueghel the Younger - Experimental Conditions - Results
  - Conclusion
- **5. Dendro-archaeological Examination of Paintings by Pieter Brueghel the Younger (Pascale Fraiture)**
  - Provenance of the Wood, Mechanical and Technical Characteristics - Planks from the Same Tree in Different Paintings - Dating - Conclusion
- **6. Attribution in Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Production in the Works Studied**
  - Core Group of Underdrawings by the Master
  - Core Group of Paintings by the Master
- **7. Charts of Variants**
  - Variable Motifs and Colours in the *Census at Bethlehem* Series
  - Variable Motifs and Colours in the *Sermon of St John the Baptist* Series
  - Variable Motifs and Colours in the *Peasant Lawyer* Series

---

This volume will be published in the IRPA/KIK *Scientia Artis* series in 2011.

---

