

THE BRUEGEL SUCCESS STORY

UNDERDRAWING AND TECHNOLOGY IN PAINTING

SYMPOSIUM XXI

Symposium XXI for the Study of Underdrawing and
Technology in Painting was organized by

The Royal Institute for Cultural Heritage, Brussels
and the Royal Museums of Fine Arts of Belgium

In cooperation with

KU Leuven – University of Leuven
Illuminare – Centre for the Study of Medieval Art
Université catholique de Louvain-la-Neuve – Laboratoire d'étude
des œuvres d'art par les méthodes scientifiques
Musea Brugge – Flemish Research Centre for the Arts in the Burgundian Netherlands
University of Liège – Transitions

With the support of the Belgian Science Policy Office (Belspo), the Moriiso Co., Ltd, visit.brussels and
The Fonds de la Recherche Scientifique – FNRS

Scientific Committee

Prof. Dominique Allart (University of Liège), Till-Holger Borchert (Bruges, Musea Brugge), Dr Véronique Bücken (Brussels, Royal Museums of Fine Arts of Belgium), Dr Hilde De Clercq (Brussels, KIK-IRPA), Jacqueline Couvert (Louvain-la-Neuve, UCL), Dr Christina Currie (Brussels, KIK-IRPA), Dr Anne Dubois (Louvain-la-Neuve, UCL), Dr Bart Fransen (Brussels, KIK-IRPA), Dr Valentine Henderiks (Brussels, ULB & Fondation Périer-D'Ieteren), Prof. Manfred Sellink, Dr Tine Meganck (Brussels, VUB), Elke Oberthaler (Vienna, Kunsthistorisches Museum), Dr Sabine Pénot (Vienna, Kunsthistorisches Museum), Prof. Ron Spronk (Nijmegen, Radboud University & Kingston, Queen's University), Dr Cyriel Stroo (Brussels, KIK-IRPA), Prof. Jan Van der Stock (KU Leuven), Dr Joris Van Grieken (Brussels, Royal Library of Belgium), Dr Dominique Vanwijnsberghe (Brussels, KIK-IRPA), Annelies Vogels (KU Leuven), Prof. em. Jørgen Wadum (Denmark, Vanløse, Wadum Art Technological Studies), Prof. Lieve Watteeuw (KU Leuven).

THE BRUEGEL SUCCESS STORY

Papers Presented at Symposium XXI for the
Study of Underdrawing and Technology in Painting,
Brussels, 12–14 September 2018

Edited by

Christina Currie,

in collaboration with

Dominique Allart, Bart Fransen, Cyriel Stroo

and Dominique Vanwijnsberghe



PEETERS

PARIS – LEUVEN – BRISTOL, CT

2021

With the support of



A catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

© Peeters Leuven, Bondgenotenlaan 153, B-3000 Leuven

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or translated in any form or by any means, by print, photoprint, microfilm, microfiche or any other means without written permission from the Publisher.

ISBN 978-90-429-4332-2
eISBN 978-90-429-4333-9
D/2021/0602/2

Editing: Lise Connellan
Coordination: Marianne Thys

Cover: Detail, Pieter Bruegel the Elder, *Dulle Griet*, Antwerp, Museum Mayer van den Bergh (inv. MMB. 0045)

Contents

| | |
|---|--|
| Editors' Preface | IX |
| PART 1 | |
| DULLE GRIET | |
| 1 | The Surprises of <i>Dulle Griet</i> Leen Huet 3 |
| 2 | Lifting the Veil: The <i>Dulle Griet</i> Rediscovered through Conservation, Scientific Imagery and Analysis Christina Currie, Steven Saverwyns, Livia Depuydt-Elbaum, Pascale Fraiture, Jean-Albert Glatigny and Alexia Coudray 19 |
| 3 | The Coloured Drawing of the <i>Dulle Griet</i> in the Kunstpalast, Düsseldorf: New Findings on its Status and Dating Christina Currie, Dominique Allart, Sonja Brink and Steven Saverwyns 45 |
| PART 2 | |
| PIETER BRUEGEL THE ELDER: MAKING, MEANING AND COPYING | |
| 4 | The <i>Adoration of the Magi</i> in the Royal Museums of Fine Arts of Belgium: Overview and New Perspectives Véronique Bücken 63 |
| 5 | The Final Piece of the Puzzle: Bruegel's Use of Cartoons in the <i>Battle between Carnival and Lent</i> and Reflections on his Preparatory Work for Painting Christina Currie 81 |
| 6 | Pieter Bruegel the Elder's <i>Triumph of Death</i> and Versions by his Sons: The Creative Process and the Art of Copying Christina Currie and Dominique Allart 105 |
| 7 | Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Copenhagen Oil Sketch of the <i>Strife between Carnival and Lent</i>, 1562 Anne Haack Christensen, Eva de la Fuente Pedersen, Aoife Daly, David Buti, Gianluca Pastorelli and Jørgen Wadum 129 |
| 8 | Is Bruegel's <i>Sleeping Peasant</i> an Image of Caricature? Yoko Mori 147 |
| 9 | The Afterlife of the <i>Detroit Wedding Dance</i>: Visual Reception, Alterations and Reinterpretations Yao-Fen You, Ellen Hanspach-Bernal, Christina Bisulca and Aaron Steele 169 |

- 10 **The Antwerp *Wedding Dance*: A Little Studied Copy after Bruegel the Elder**
Marie Postec and Pascale Fraiture 191

PART 3

JAN BRUEGHEL IN CONTEXT

- 11 ***Copia*, Copying and Painterly Eloquence**
Elizabeth Alice Honig 207
- 12 **The Master of the Dresden *Landscape with the Continnence of Scipio*:
A Journeyman in the Studio of Jan Brueghel the Elder?**
Uta Neidhardt 227
- 13 **Examination of the Brueghel Holdings in the Bayerische
Staatsgemäldesammlungen, Munich**
Mirjam Neumeister, Eva Ortner and Jan Schmidt 243
- 14 **Jan Brueghel the Elder's Oil Sketches of Animals and Birds: Form, Function
and Additions to the Oeuvre**
Amy Orrock 261
- 15 **Sibling Rivalry: Jan Brueghel's Rediscovered Early *Crucifixion***
Larry Silver 279

PART 4

THE BRUEGEL NETWORK AND LEGACY

- 16 **Peasant Passions: Pieter Bruegel and his Aftermath**
Ethan Matt Kavalier 289
- 17 **Behind the Scenes in Pieter Bruegel's 'Success Story': Pieter Coecke's Networks
and Legacy**
Annick Born 319
- 18 **Bruegel and Beuckelaer: Contacts and Contrasts**
Lorne Campbell 343
- 19 **Max J. Friedländer's Perception of Bruegel: Rereading the Art Historian from
a Historical Perspective**
Hilde Cuvelier 359
- 20 **Erasmus's *De Copia* and Bruegel the Elder's 'inverted' *Carrying of the Cross* (1564):
An 'abundant style' in Rhetoric, Literature and Art?**
Jamie L. Edwards 369
- 21 **Pieter Bruegel the Elder and France**
Patrick Le Chanu 385
- 22 **In Search of the Bruegel Family's Homes and Studios in Antwerp**
Petra Maclot 397

| | | |
|-----------------|--|-----|
| 23 | Bruegel's Patrons: How 'Close Viewing' May Reveal Original Ownership Tine Luk Meganck | 413 |
| 24 | Pieter Bruegel's <i>The Heath</i>: Collectors and Connoisseurs Jan Muylle | 425 |
| 25 | Bruegel across Modes and Materials: Notes on a Painted Palace in Sixteenth-Century Segovia Daan van Heesch | 435 |
| 26 | An Enigmatic Panel-Maker from Antwerp and his Supply to the Bruegels Ingrid Moortgat and Jørgen Wadum | 453 |
| 27 | <i>View of the Strait of Messina</i>, by Circle of Pieter Bruegel the Elder: Drawing Techniques and Materials Examined Lieve Watteeuw, Marina Van Bos, Joris Van Grieken, Maarten Bassens, Bruno Vandermeulen and Hendrik Hameeuw | 465 |
| ADDENDUM | | |
| | The <i>Dulle Griet</i>: A Thematic and Synthetic Analysis Gaston Vandendriessche († 2002), with a foreword by Dominique Vanwijnsberghe | 477 |
| | Bibliography | 511 |
| | Contributors | 543 |
| | Photographic Credits | 549 |