



SCIENTIA ARTIS 8

# The Brueg[H]el Phenomenon

Paintings by Pieter Bruegel the Elder and Pieter Brueghel the Younger  
with a Special Focus on Technique and Copying Practice

Christina Currie & Dominique Allart



# The Brueg[H]el Phenomenon



Published by the  
Royal Institute for Cultural Heritage | Koninklijk Instituut voor het Kunstpatrimonium (KIK) |  
Institut royal du Patrimoine artistique (IRPA)  
Jubelpark 1 | Parc du Cinquantenaire 1  
B-1000 Brussels  
[www.kikirpa.be](http://www.kikirpa.be)

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of the publisher, or as expressly permitted by law, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics rights organization.

Editor-in-chief: Christina Ceulemans  
Revision and editing: Lee Preedy  
Image processing: Sophie De Potter, Olivier Depauw, Bernard Petit and Catherine Fondaire  
Website: Sophie De Potter and Hans Opstaele

Every effort has been made to comply with legal copyright requirements. The publisher will be pleased to rectify any omission brought to their notice at the earliest opportunity.

ISBN 978-2-930054-14-8

SCIENTIA ARTIS 8

# The Brueg[H]el Phenomenon

**Paintings by Pieter Bruegel the Elder and Pieter Brueghel the Younger  
with a Special Focus on Technique and Copying Practice**

Christina Currie and Dominique Allart

**Volume I**

Royal Institute for Cultural Heritage

Brussels 2012

# Contents

## Volume I

Foreword .....	15
Preface .....	17
Acknowledgements .....	21
Notes to the Reader .....	27
Abbreviations .....	27
 Introduction .....	 29

### 1. A Great Painter of the Renaissance, his Heir and Copyist and the Antwerp Art Market

A Brilliant Dynasty of Painters .....	37
Pieter Bruegel the Elder: his Life and Work .....	38
Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Posthumous Fame .....	42
The Proliferation of Copies after Pieter Bruegel the Elder at the End of the Sixteenth Century .....	46
Pieter Bruegel the Younger: his Life and Work .....	48
<i>Inique facis nisi Patrem in Filio nosci</i> : Pieter Bruegel the Younger as Continuator of his Father .....	52
The Art Market in Antwerp at the Time of Pieter Bruegel the Younger .....	56
Reconstructing the Organizational Practices of Antwerp Workshops .....	63
<i>Rechte princepalen!</i> The Rise of Connoisseurship .....	67
The Works of Pieter Bruegel the Younger in Seventeenth-Century Antwerp Inventories .....	72
Signatures and Dates in the Works of Bruegel the Elder and Bruegel the Younger .....	74

### 2. The Painting Technique of Pieter Bruegel the Elder: Four Case Studies

<i>Status Quaestionis</i> .....	93
Preliminary Note on the Paintings Examined .....	99
 <b>Case Study 1. <i>The Census at Bethlehem</i> (Brussels, Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België   Musées royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique)</b> .....	 101
Provenance .....	102
Inscriptions .....	103
Painting Support .....	103
Format and Construction - <i>Barbes</i> and Unprepared Lateral Borders - Condition	
Preparatory Layers .....	107
Underdrawing .....	107
Form and Function - Drawing Medium - Position of Underdrawing in the Layer Structure - The Role of the Underdrawing in the Creative Process	

Paint Layer .....	117
Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Modifications during Painting	
Conclusion .....	138
<b>Case Study 2. <i>The Sermon of St John the Baptist</i> (Budapest, Szépművészeti Múzeum)</b> .....	143
Provenance .....	143
Inscriptions .....	145
Painting Support .....	146
Format and Construction - <i>Barbes</i> and Unprepared Borders - Condition	
Preparatory Layers .....	148
Underdrawing .....	148
Form and Function - The Role of the Underdrawing in the Creative Process	
Paint Layer .....	161
Condition - Palette - Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Gesture and Expression - Modifications during Painting	
Conclusion .....	179
<b>Case Study 3. <i>The Winter Landscape with Bird Trap</i> (Brussels, Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België   Musées royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique)</b> .....	185
Provenance, Rediscovery and Early Controversy .....	185
Inscriptions .....	192
Fingerprint .....	193
Painting Support .....	194
Format and Construction - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Condition	
Preparatory Layers .....	195
Underdrawing .....	195
Form and Function - The Place of the Underdrawing in the Evolution of the Composition - An Early Drawing of the Composition	
Paint Layer .....	205
Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling	
Conclusion .....	219
<b>Case Study 4. <i>The Adoration of the Magi</i> (Winterthur, Dr Oskar Reinhart Collection 'Am Römerholz')</b> .....	225
Provenance .....	226
Inscriptions .....	226
Painting Support .....	227
Format and Construction - Condition	
Preparatory Layers .....	230
Underdrawing .....	231
Paint Layer .....	231
Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling	
Conclusion .....	240

### 3. Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Painting Technique: a Reassessment

<b>Painting Supports</b> .....	245
Format and Construction .....	245
<i>Barbes</i> and Unprepared Borders .....	246

<b>Preparatory Layers</b> .....	249
Ground .....	249
<i>Imprimatura</i> .....	251
<b>Underdrawing</b> .....	259
Drawing Materials .....	259
Position of Underdrawing in the Layer Structure .....	263
Underdrawing Styles and Modifications during Drawing and Painting .....	265
<b>Painting Techniques</b> .....	282
Pigment Analysis and Layer Structure .....	282
Sequence of Painting .....	286
Brushwork and Handling .....	294
<b>Conclusion</b> .....	313

## Volume II

### 4. The Painting Technique of Pieter Brueghel the Younger and his Workshop: Ten Case Studies

<i>Status Quaestionis</i> .....	333
Preliminary Note on the Paintings Examined .....	341
<b>Case Study 1. Copies of the <i>Battle between Carnival and Lent</i> after Pieter Bruegel the Elder</b> .....	345
Inscriptions .....	346
Painting Supports .....	346
Format and Panel Construction - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - <i>Barbes</i> and Unprepared Lateral Borders	
Preparatory Layers .....	347
Transfer of the Design to the Prepared Panel Surface: Evidence for the Use of Pricked Cartoons .....	348
A Series of Smaller Cartoons rather than a Whole Sheet	
Underdrawing .....	349
Form and Function - Modifications in Relation to the Pounced Design - Style	
Paint Layer .....	358
Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling	
The Original Model and the Cartoon .....	361
The Possible Whereabouts of the Original Version at the Time of Brueghel the Younger - The Original Version and the Five Copies: a Comparison - The Christie's New York Version - The Portland Version - A Hierarchy of Copies - The Source of the Cartoons	
Conclusion .....	377
<b>Case Study 2. Copies of the <i>Census at Bethlehem</i> after Pieter Bruegel the Elder</b> .....	381
Inscriptions .....	381
Painting Supports .....	384
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - The Panel-maker and Branding - <i>Barbes</i> and Unprepared Lateral Borders	
Preparatory Layers .....	390
Underdrawing .....	395
Form and Function - Modifications during Underdrawing and Painting - Stylistic Variation and the Question of Attribution	

Paint Layer .....	407
Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Reflections on Attribution - Style and Brushwork in Comparison to Bruegel the Elder's Original Version	
The Model for the Copies .....	424
Key Elements in Bruegel the Elder's Original Painting that are Missing in the Copies - Key Elements Transformed in the Copies - Misinterpretation of Original Motifs - Elements in the Underdrawing of the Original Dropped during Painting but Repeated in the Copies - Colours - Placement of Signature - Pre-conclusion	
Variants among the Copies .....	428
Five Variants and a Possible Sub-variant - Motifs Varying According to Group - Dating - Secondary Models - Pre-conclusion	
Copying Process .....	433
The Use of Cartoons - Transfer Process - The Source of the Cartoons	
Conclusion .....	440
<b>Case Study 3. Copies of the <i>Sermon of St John the Baptist</i> after Pieter Bruegel the Elder</b> .....	447
Inscriptions .....	447
Painting Supports .....	450
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding - <i>Barbes</i> and Unprepared Lateral Borders	
Preparatory Layers .....	452
Underdrawing .....	457
Form and Function - Style and Attribution	
Paint Layer .....	460
Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution	
The Model for the Copies .....	468
Comparison of the Sons' Copies with Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Budapest Version - Possible Working Relationship between Pieter Brueghel the Younger and Jan Brueghel the Elder - Two Variants	
Copying Process .....	474
Use of Cartoons and Transfer Process - Partial Correlation with Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Budapest Version	
Conclusion .....	479
<b>Case Study 4. Copies of the <i>Winter Landscape with Bird Trap</i> after Pieter Bruegel the Elder</b> .....	485
Inscriptions .....	485
Painting Supports .....	487
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding	
Preparatory Layers .....	489
Underdrawing .....	491
Form and Function - Attribution	
Paint Layer .....	495
Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution	
The Model for the Copies .....	500
Bruegel the Elder's Version in the Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België   Musées royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique - The Case of the Painting in the Former M. A. Hassid Collection	
Copying Process .....	509
Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Two Additional Motifs in the Mayer van den Bergh and Coppée-le Hodey Versions	
Brueghel's Competition: Contemporary Copies and Variants Produced by Other Workshops .....	512
<i>Excursus</i> : a Late Nineteenth- or Early Twentieth-Century Copy .....	517
Conclusion .....	518



<b>Case Study 5. Copies of the <i>Adoration of the Magi</i> after Pieter Bruegel the Elder</b>	525
Inscriptions	525
Painting Supports	525
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding	
Preparatory Layers	527
Underdrawing	528
Form and Function - Attribution	
Paint Layer	529
Condition - Palette, Paint Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution	
The Model for the Copies	537
Differences between Bruegel the Elder's Original Version and the Copies - Two Faithful Copies	
Copying Process	540
Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Differences among the Copies - A Copy from outside Brueghel the Younger's Workshop	
Conclusion	542
<b>Case Study 6. <i>The Magpie on the Gallows: a Unique Copy</i> after Pieter Bruegel the Elder</b>	547
Inscription	547
Painting Support	548
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks	
Preparatory Layers	549
Underdrawing	551
Paint Layer	557
Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling	
The Model for the Copy	562
Bruegel the Elder's Original Version - A Version in the Former Bruno Donath Collection	
Copying Process	564
The Original Version and the Copy: a Comparison	565
Conclusion	570
<b>Case Study 7. Copies of the <i>Wedding Dance in the Open Air</i> probably after a Lost Painting by Pieter Bruegel the Elder</b>	573
Inscriptions	575
Painting Supports	575
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding	
Preparatory Layers	578
Underdrawing	582
Form and Function - Drawing Notations - Attribution	
Paint Layer	585
Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Adjustments in Design during Drawing and Painting - Attribution	
Copying Process	595
Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Motifs not Included in the Cartoon - Colour	
Regarding the Model	598
The Engraving by Pieter van der Heyden - The Peasant Wedding Dance in the Detroit Institute of Arts - Evidence for a Lost Painting by Pieter Bruegel the Elder: Versions by Jan Brueghel the Elder and a Variant by Maerten van Cleve	
Conclusion	609

<b>Case Study 8. Copies of the <i>Crucifixion</i> probably after a Lost Painting by Pieter Bruegel the Elder</b>	615
Inscriptions	617
Creation of a Compositional Variant and Collaboration with Joos de Momper the Younger	618
Painting Supports	619
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding - <i>Barbes</i> and Unprepared Lateral Borders	
Preparatory Layers	622
Underdrawing	623
Form and Function - Attribution	
Paint Layer	627
Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Brushwork, Handling and Attribution - Sequence of Painting	
Copying Process	633
Common Cartoons for the Figures - Townscape and Landscape Backgrounds: no Evidence for a Common Cartoon - Colour Correspondence in the Figures	
Regarding the Model	635
A Lost <i>Crucifixion</i> by Pieter Bruegel the Elder: Source Documents - The Vienna Version of the <i>Crucifixion</i> by Jan Brueghel the Elder - Searching for the Appearance of a Lost Original by Pieter Bruegel the Elder	
Conclusion	642
<b>Case Study 9. Copies of the <i>Massacre of the Innocents</i> probably after a Lost Painting by Maerten van Cleve</b>	647
Inscriptions	647
Painting Supports	648
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating	
Preparatory Layers	648
Underdrawing	649
Form and Function - Attribution	
Paint Layer	651
Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution	
Copying Process and Reflections on the Model	658
Original Model - Transfer Process	
The Version in the Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België   Musées royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique: Evidence of a Cover-up	662
The First Painting - Re-use of Panels in the Sixteenth Century - Why this Re-use in Brueghel's Workshop?	
Conclusion	667
<b>Case Study 10. Copies of the <i>Peasant Lawyer</i> after an Anonymous Model</b>	671
Inscriptions	671
Painting Supports	673
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding	
Preparatory Layers	675
Underdrawing	677
Form and Function - Attribution	
Paint Layer	683
Condition - Palette and Pigments - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution	
Copying Process and Reflections on the Model	695
The Lost Prototype - Two Variants - Use of Cartoons and Transfer Process	
Copies by Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Contemporaries and Later Imitators	700
Conclusion	707

## Volume III

### 5. Demystifying the Process: Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Workshop Practice

<b>Painting Supports</b> .....	729
Format and Provenance of the Wood .....	729
<i>Barbes</i> and Unpainted Lateral Borders, with Corresponding Rebates on the Reverse .....	732
The Antwerp Brand and Panel-makers' Marks .....	733
Quality .....	738
<b>Preparatory Layers</b> .....	742
Ground .....	742
<i>Imprimatura</i> .....	742
<b>The Role of Cartoons</b> .....	746
The Transfer Process .....	746
Single or Partial Pricked Cartoons .....	746
The Nature of the Cartoons: an Original Master Cartoon and Working 'Substitute Cartoons' .....	750
<b>Underdrawing</b> .....	752
Graphite and Black Chalk as Underdrawing Media .....	752
The Position of the Underdrawing in the Layer Structure .....	755
The Extent and Character of the Underdrawing .....	755
Cartoon Transfer and Underdrawing Step-by-Step .....	757
<b>Painting Techniques</b> .....	760
Palette .....	760
Pigment Analysis and Layer Structure .....	760
Sequence of Painting .....	763
Brushwork and Handling .....	763
Mimicking his Father's Brushwork .....	773
Late Additions .....	778

### 6. Searching for the Hand of Pieter Brueghel the Younger

<b>The Underdrawings</b> .....	785
A Core Group of Underdrawings by the Master .....	788
Underdrawings outside the Core Group .....	796
The Attribution of Independent Drawings to Pieter Brueghel the Younger .....	797
<b>The Painting Stage</b> .....	802
A Core Group of Paintings by the Master .....	803
Paintings outside the Core Group .....	809
Significance of a Signature .....	812

## 7. Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Models and Variants

<b>Brueghel the Younger's Models</b> .....	817
Paintings for which Bruegel the Elder's Original Versions still Survive .....	817
Paintings Presumed to be after Lost Works by Bruegel the Elder .....	822
Paintings after Missing Works by Other Artists .....	822
<b>Variants and Variation in Brueghel the Younger's Production</b> .....	823
Compositional Variants .....	823
Variation in the Later Years .....	825
Organizational Practices under Brueghel the Younger's Direction .....	825

## 8. Outside Brueghel the Younger's Workshop

<b>Deceptive Resemblance: Copies in the Manner of Pieter Brueghel the Younger</b> .....	831
<b>Distinctive Features in Copies by Jan Brueghel the Elder</b> .....	834
<b>Solving a Famous Controversy: Two Versions of the <i>Fall of Icarus</i></b> .....	844
The Version in the Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België   Musées royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique .....	846
Provenance - Support - Radiocarbon Dating - Underdrawing - Paint Layer - Conclusion	
The Version in the Van Buuren Museum in Brussels .....	864
Provenance - Support - Underdrawing - Paint Layer - Conclusion	
Last Word .....	872

## 9. Understanding the Father through the Son: Lost Secrets of Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Working Practice

<b>Evidence from the Copies: Bruegel's Lost Compositional Drawings</b> .....	879
<b>Evidence from the Copies: Bruegel's Lost Cartoons</b> .....	880
<b>Evidence from the Originals: the Nature of the Lost Cartoons</b> .....	882
<b>Other Preparatory Material Employed by Bruegel</b> .....	884
<b>Record Copies?</b> .....	884
<b>Model Drawings and Preparatory Cartoons in the Southern Netherlands</b> .....	886
<b>From Drawing to Painting: Bruegel's Creative Process Reconstructed</b> .....	890

<b>Conclusions</b> .....	900
--------------------------	-----



<b>Bibliography</b> .....	907
<b>Appendices</b>	
I. Paintings by Pieter Bruegel the Elder and from the Workshop of Pieter Brueghel the Younger: Inscriptions and Key Technical Features .....	926
II. Historical Copying Techniques .....	935
Cartoons - Squaring-up - Pouncing - Tracing - The Counterproof Method - The Proportional Compass - The Pantograph	
III. Practical Reconstructions (Christina Currie and Bob Ghys) .....	957
Preparation of Test Panels and Drawing Materials - Squaring-up - Tracing - Pouncing - Pantograph - Alternative Methods - Discussion	
IV. Identifying Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Underdrawing Media (Christina Currie and Steven Saverwyns) .....	981
Historical Context .....	982
Black Chalk - Graphite - Metalpoint	
Identification of Underdrawing in Paint Samples .....	985
Analysis of Underdrawing in Brueghel the Younger's Paintings .....	986
Experimental Conditions - <i>Crucifixion</i> - <i>Massacre of the Innocents</i> (medium format) - <i>Wedding Dance in the Open Air</i> - <i>Massacre of the Innocents</i> (large format) - X-ray Fluorescence Analysis of Two Small-format Paintings by Brueghel the Younger	
Conclusion .....	998
V. Dendro-archaeological Examination of Paintings by Pieter Brueghel the Younger (Pascale Fraiture) ...	1002
Provenance of the Wood, Mechanical and Technical Characteristics - Planks from the Same Tree in Different Paintings - Dating - Pieter Bruegel the Elder and Pieter Brueghel the Younger: a Changed Economic Context	
VI. Attribution in Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Production .....	1017
Core Group of Underdrawings by Brueghel the Younger .....	1017
Core Group of Paintings by Brueghel the Younger .....	1019
VII. Charts of Variants .....	1022
a Variable Motifs and Colours in the <i>Census at Bethlehem</i> Series .....	1022
b Variable Motifs and Colours in the <i>Sermon of St John the Baptist</i> Series .....	1026
c Variable Motifs and Colours in the <i>Peasant Lawyer</i> Series .....	1030
<b>Index of Works</b> .....	1035
<b>Illustration Credits</b> .....	1057



In the decades that followed Pieter Bruegel the Elder's early death, the fame of that great Renaissance painter was at its peak. But few of his paintings were available for purchase and so conditions were ripe for the emergence of an imitator – none other than his elder son Pieter Brueghel the Younger, who became his father's continuator *par excellence*. At the end of the sixteenth century and the beginning of the seventeenth, Brueghel the Younger and his workshop turned out large numbers of replicas for collectors of Bruegelian works. The extraordinary resemblance of these copies to the originals is all the more remarkable given that so many of Bruegel the Elder's paintings were by then inaccessible in private collections.

This three-volume book explores the intriguing Brueg[h]el phenomenon through the two artists' painting practices. The technical aspects of their works are investigated using the most up-to-date technology and are strikingly elucidated with a wealth of colour illustrations, revealing the accomplished practitioner behind the genius that is Bruegel the Elder and the working procedures of his foremost emulator's studio. Moreover, Brueghel the Younger's own exceptional qualities as a painter are distinguished from those of his workshop production. And fresh discoveries on the father's creative process through the study of his son's copies are also revealed.

The Scientia Artis series is published by the Royal Institute for Cultural Heritage (KIK-IRPA, Brussels). The works in this series – monographs, exhibition catalogues and conference proceedings – present the results of research projects and scientific events (co)organized by the KIK-IRPA. Since 1948 this Federal Scientific Institution has been charged with the study, protection and promotion of Belgium's cultural heritage. [www.kikirpa.be](http://www.kikirpa.be)



Royal Institute for Cultural Heritage

Université  
de Liège



.be

